UNIJERPS
Unizik Journal of Educational Research and Policy Studies VOL.19 (3);
January-June, 2025 https://unijerps.org
2023 Impact Factor: **6.834;** 2022 ***Impact Factor***: 5.156; ***2021 Impact Factor: 5.641;***
2020 Impact Factor: 5.355. *Indexing and Impact Factor URL:* http://sjifactor.com/passport.php?id=21363

COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THE EFFECTIVENESS OF COMMUNICATIVE AND ECLECTIC APPROACHES IN STUDENTS' MEAN ACHIEVEMENT SCORES IN ENGLISH LANGUAGE

Dr. (Mrs) Okafor Elizabeth Nwamaka
Department Of Curriculum & Instruction, F.C.E (T) Umunze, Anambra State
drlizzyokafor@yahoo.com 08036920598

ABSTRACT

The study investigated the effects of communicative and eclectic approaches in students' mean achievement scores in English language. The research design is based on a quasi-experimental non-randomized pre-test and post-test control group design. The population of the study comprised all 1236 students from which a sample of 170 students were randomly selected in their intact classes. The three classes used were assigned randomly to CLT, ELT and LM. Data was collected using the grammar proficiency test (GPT). The mean, standard deviation and Ancova statistics were used for data analysis, which provided answers to the questions and the hypothesis. Results showed that the students taught grammar using the CLT and ELT did not differ significantly in their mean achievement scores and gender did not influence achievement scores due to method. It was recommended that teachers should use these friendly methods that enhanced achievement scores in the study of grammatical aspect of English language for teaching.

Keywords: Effectiveness, communication, comparative, eclectic approach and achievement.

Introduction

Language is a system of symbols designed for the purpose of communication. The system is made up of sound and vocal symbols that the users of any language have accepted to use as means of communication. In this direction, Okumo (2018) observed that communication is an essential element. It forms the core of the individual's day' to day activities since people share or transmit information, ideas, thoughts, feelings and messages from one person to another through it. [osikomaiya: 2005 The author argued further that for a learner to communicate effectively in any language, the language learner must be proficient on the pronunciation of words in the language. This proficiency facilitates ability for clear purposely presentation and reception of ideas, thoughts in a given situation or during any discussion. In a similar argument, Osianwo (2012) observed that speakers must study the properties of the sound system, which they must internalize in order to use their language for the purpose of communication

Literature Review

There is no doubt that effective communication in all human activities is dependent on sound use of language of the environment. In educational processes, language plays significant part as a vehicle for transmission. This expressive function of various languages makes it very essential in human development. Okumo (2018) argued language 1s unique in its own way. This is because, out of the entire sound inventory that the vocal organ is capable of producing, different languages select and

combine these sounds depending on the phonological pattern of the language. On the basis of this unique selection, a non-native speaker of English, for instance, may find it difficult to pronounce English words because the sounds employed, and how they are structured to produce words, may not be in line with the pronunciation of the, speaker's native language.

People learn their mother tongue (and ideally other languages too) in use and in context for the purpose of communication especially with outside world different from one's country or nation, knowledge of a second language becomes inevitable if one is to function very well unaided. Second language is a non-native language a learner acquires after the mother tongue.in most cases. It is officially taught in schools. The country's official second language is English. It was introduced with the colonization of the country and had since remained the nation's major tool for communication with larger part of the outside world. To all intents and purpose, English language is the medium of intellectual transformation, occupational and social mobility, and the crystallization of national consciousness. Despite the emphasis placed on the teaching and learning of English language in Nigeria language-teaching methods have not been steady.at one time there would be emphasis on teaching the rules of the language and at another time the emphasis would be on practice and repetition without teaching the rules.

In the light of the above, Osa-Omoregie and Gbenedio (2018), stressed that the teaching methods should be made to be effective through close attention. The authors are of the view that teachers in Nigerian secondary school system seem to pay attention to teachers centred method, chief of which is the "product approach".

Student's achievement in English language has not been encouraging. This has continued to be a source of worries to teachers, parents, examination bodies. Absorbing tertiary institutions. One of such areas the students have not performed successfully is grammar. This agrees with WAEC (2017) chief examiner's reports. That poor knowledge of grammar exhibited by the candidates is alarming. The document further observed that many schools do not teach grammar language especially mechanical accuracy, i.e. correctness of grammatical construction. In a similar argument for the poor performance, Nnamani (2018), argued that one of the greatest ironies of the information age is that, while the 21st century has witnessed an avalanche of written information, students' interest in print reading has declined. The situation has also contributed to poor grasp of grammatical structure of the English language both as spoken and written.

The situation above has continued to attract the attention of researchers towards identifying effective methods for teaching grammar in schools. One of such approaches is the eclectic method of teaching. There is no doubt that instructional methods are employed to bring about increased achievement. Shah (2008) defined learning 'achievement as the level of student success 1n learning the subject matter in schools that are expressed in the form of scores obtained from the result of the tests on a particular subject

matter. The eclectic approach refers to a teaching approach that is not based on a single method (e.g., task-based teaching) but that draws on several different methods, principles that are made use of in practice. (Richards; 2014) The author observed that this approach has the following principles

1. What particular problem do the learners encounter in mastering a particular aspect or language use?
2. What particular procedures the teachers using available methods and approaches to handle the present learning problems can use?

The choice of a particular approach in teaching a particular concept such as grammar in English language is to ensure effectiveness and hence improve achievement scores of students in the area of study. For every teacher, the most challenging task is to grab a student attention and convey the message in an effective way. This involves initiating and sustaining both interest and attention of the learners throughout the lesson. (Ananda; 2020), this author observed that this practice will ensure improved achievement in school activities. The eclectic approach that aims at employing a particular appropriate method/strategy in teaching a particular subject can be effectively used to address the observed students' general poor achievement in English grammar. The present study is therefore set to investigate into the effectiveness of communicative and eclectic approaches in students' achievement in English language.

The present study is anchored on the mentalist or cognitive and socio- linguistic theories. The theorist of cognitivism stressed that the learner is naturally endowed with Language Acquisition Device (LAD) which makes the acquisition of the mother tongue a natural process that do not require classroom teaching This characteristic helps the child to verbalize underlying structures that lead to better learning and greater facility in generating new sentences. In contrast, the socio-linguistic theorist 1S of the view that interaction is a means of learning. Language learning therefore requires that the individual will be exposed to both formal and informal social contexts that favour language learning.

Objectives of the study, Research questions and hypotheses

The researcher therefore sets to investigate the effectiveness of communicative and eclectic approaches in student's achievement in English languages with specific attention to grammar among secondary school students in Aguata education zone of Anambra state. The research questions and hypothesis stated below explored the specific objective of the study.

Research Questions

1. To what extent does communicative language teaching enhance students' achievement in grammar of English language?
2. To what extent does eclectic approach facilitate students' achievement in English language grammar?

Hypotheses

1. There is no significant difference in the mean achievement scores of students taught grammar using CLT

and those students taught with eclectic method.

2. There is no significant difference in the mean performance scores of males, females taught grammar with CLT, and those taught with eclectic method.

Methodology

Three intact classes were randomly assigned to Communicative Language Teaching (CLT), Eclectic Language Teaching (ELT) and Lecture Method (LM) respectively. The treatment lasted for three weeks. Pilot study was first carried out before the study and this provided the researcher rich insight into process and likely problems that were promptly addressed before the actual experimental treatment. Experimental group A was taught the principles of communicative language teaching, which involved grammar lessons in nouns, pronounce phrases and clauses. This involves organized structural practice information gap exercises, presenting meaningful items using pictures. Individual completing of sentences and group work.

Similarly, experimental group B was taught using eclectic approach. This method was used to teach grammar lessons in noun, pronoun, phrase and clause. It entails the integration of principles of grammar translation method and those of direct method [Williams; 1999]. However, the control group was taught using lecture method. This involved simple explanation of grammar lessons on noun, pronoun, phrase and clauses. At last, the students were expected to respond to questions from the teacher.

A week before the treatment, pre-test was administered to the subjects in both the experimental groups and control group using grammar and comprehension proficiency test (form A)

Study Designs: The pre-test, post-test, non-equivalent control group quasi-experimental design was adopted.

Research Design

Group	Pre-test	Treatment	Post-test
E_1	O_1	X_1	O_2
E_2	O_1	X_2	O_2
C	O_1	-	O_2

E_1 = Experimental group I
E_2 = Experimental group II
C = Control group
O_1 = Pre-test
O_2 = Post-test
X_1 = Treatment level I (Communicative Teaching method)
X_2 = Treatment level II (Eclectic approach)
Control Group (lecture method)

Population and Sample

W_2 = Treatment level 2 (Eclectic method).
The population comprised of 1236 Students of SS two from 31 co-educational secondary schools in education zone W Purposive, stratified and simple random sampling techniques were used to draw a sample of 170 students from three schools.

57 students in intact class were assigned to experimental group A with 23 and 34 males and females respectively. Experimental group B is also of 57 students with 22 males and 35 females. The control group has students with 21 males and 35 females.

Instrument for Data Collection

One instrument was used to collect data for this study: This was Grammar Proficiency Test (GPT). It was a modified form of Basic English Brush Up by Smith and Mohr (1995), It measures grammar proficiency in four areas of Nouns, pronouns, phrases and clauses. It has 100 question items equally distributed. Pearson product moment correlation coefficient method was used to establish the reliability index of r = 0.97. This was considered high and adequate for the study.

Experimental Procedure

The study lasted for 8 weeks using the normal school time-table. The pre-test was administered in the first week. Normal class teaching of five periods per week lasted for six weeks while the last week was used for the administration of the post-test.

Procedure for Data Collection

The pre-test was first administered in the first week to all the three groups. This was used to establish the homogeneity of the groups and their entry point ability. The result showed that the subjects were homogeneous in ability before the normal treatment.

Data Analysis

Data collected were analysed using the descriptive statistics; mean and standard deviation and hypotheses were tested at 0.05 alpha levels using the analysis of covariance (ANCOVA)

Results and discussion of Findings

Findings

Research Question 1: To what extent does communicative language teaching method enhance student's achievement score in grammar?

Table one: Mean and Standard deviation scores

Grammar Items	CLT = 57			
	Pre-test		Post-test	
	$\overline{X}$	SD	$\overline{X}$	SD
Nouns and Grammatical Functions	16.07	1.98	19.38	2.37
Pronouns and Grammatical Functions	17.14	1.97	19.51	2.15
Phrases	14.23	1.50	16.23	1.56
Clauses	13.98	1.46	15.63	1.51

Table one shows that pre-test and post-test mean scores in grammatical items using CLT. These are 16.07, 17.14, 14.23 and 13.98 while post-test mean scores are 19.38, 19.51, 16.23 and 15.63. The post-test mean scores are higher than the pre-test.

Research Question 2: To what extent does eclectic method facilitate student's achievement in grammar of English language.

Table Two: Mean and standard deviation scores in ELT grammar related data

Grammar Items	ELT = 57			
	Pre-test		Post-test	
	$\overline{X}$	SD	$\overline{X}$	SD
Nouns and Grammatical Functions	16.07	1.98	18.28	2.16
Pronouns and Grammatical Functions	17.14	1.97	19.33	2.15
Phrases	14.23	1.50	16.16	1.65
Clauses	13.98	1.46	15.58	1.55

From table two, the pre-test mean achievement scores of the students in grammatical items using ELT are (16.07, 17.14, 14.23, 13.98) while the post-test mean scores are 18.28, 19.33, 16.16 and 15.58. The post-test mean scores are of different grammar items are higher than the post-test scores.

Hypothesis one: There is no significant difference in the mean achievement scores of students taught grammar using CLT and those students taught grammar with eclectic method.

Table three: Summary of ANCOVA for CLT, ELT and LM methods of teaching data.

Source of Variation	Sum of Squares	Degree of Freedom	Mean Square	f-Cal	Sig off
Covariate	14486.654	1	14486.654	595.354	.000
Pre-test	14486.654	1	14486.654	595.354	.000
Main effect	4045.861	2	2025.931	83.259	.080
Method	32.039	1	32.039	1.317	.252
Type	4051.861	1	2025.931	83.295	.080
Interaction	58.297	1	58.297	2.396	.123
Explained	19698.677	4	4924.669	202.388	.000
Residual	25100.564	222	24.333		
Total	25100.564	226	111.064		

The result of data analysis presented in table three above shows the f-calculated value of 83.259 was not significant in 0.08 probability value, the null hypothesis was not rejected. Students mean achievement scores did not differ significant in grammar due to methods used in teaching.

Hypothesis Two: There is no significant difference in the mean achievement scores of the male and female students taught grammar with CLT and those taught with ELT.

Table Four: Summary of ANCOVA for male and female taught grammar using CLT and ELT

Source of Variation	Sum of Squares	Degree of Freedom	Mean Square	f-Cal	Sig off
Covariate	15440.70	1	15440.70	363.233	.000
Pre-test	15440.70	1	15440.70	363.233	.000
Main effect	57.424	2	28.712	.675	.510
Method	47.401	1	47.401	1.115	.292
Type	10.229	1	10.229	.241	.624
Interaction	26.159	1	26.159	.615	.434
Explained	15663.556	4	3915.889	92.119	.000
Residual	9437.008	222	42.509		
Total	25100.564	226	111.064		

From table four above, the calculate f-ratio of .675 for main effect does not significant with probability value of .510. Students' mean achievement scores in grammar differ significantly due to gender.

Discussion of Finding and Conclusion

Discussion of Findings

This study, which investigated the effectiveness of communicative and eclectic approaches in students mean achievement scores in grammar in English language ability, revealed that CLT and ELT were equivalently effective in enhancing the mean achievement scores of the students in grammar among the experimental groups. The study also revealed that gender of the students did not significantly influence the student's mean achievement scores in grammatical item studied.

The implication above is that both CLT and ELT empowered students effectively without differing impacts in the study of grammatical aspects of English language. The study also revealed that there was significant difference between the pre- and post-test mean achievement scores in grammar due to method of teaching. This shows that both methods needed some improvement in the study of grammar and were effective for teaching grammar.

The findings of this study are in agreement with the findings of Orogbu (2006) that carried out a study that revealed that type of instructional method employed for teaching is a significant factor that influences achievement. Similarly, gender of the students was not a factor that significantly influenced mean achievement scores irrespective of method of teaching.

Conclusion

The CLT and the ELT were found to be equally effective in enhancing students mean achievement scores in the study of grammatical items in English language. Gender also was not a significant factor that Influenced students mean achievement scores S grammatical items studied in English. The research believes that CLT and ELT, if adopted by teachers in teaching grammar will improve students' achievement in the study of grammatical aspects of English in schools irrespective of schools and gender of the students.

Recommendations

Based on the findings of the study, and the conclusion drawn there from the following recommendations are made: Teachers should pay attention to the teaching of grammatical aspects of English using the of CLT and ELT which are both effective in teaching grammatical structures of English in language. This study can also be replicated in other states and perhaps for hunger periods to see of ift the same results can be achievement. Ministries of education should provide opportunities for English teachers to attend in service training and workshops to enhance their knowledge and use of methods other than the traditional approach they are familiar with and use. Other students-centered methods should be tried out to find out of all students centered methods will produce the same results.

REFERENCES

Ananda, K, D (2020) Strategies to Enhancing Effectiveness in Classroom Teaching. (n The Knowledgereview.Com)

Nnamani, O, (2018) Providing Reading Choices in an English Language Classroom At ESUT: A survey in *Research 1n English and Applied Linguistics* By Schmied, J, Hofmann, M and Esimaje, A. (Cuvillier Verlag)

Ogbu, C (2006) Effects of Cooperative and Product Teaching On Senior Secondary School Student's Achievement in Essay Writing in Afikpo North Education Zone of Ebonyi State, Nigeria Unpublished P.H.D Thesis EBSU PG Abstract.

Okumo, F (2018) Investigating The Effects Of L, and L, (English) Pronunciation Among Tertiary Students in Southern Nigeria in *Research in English and Applied Linguistics*: By Schmied, J, Hofmann, M and Esimaje, A. (Cuvillier Verlag).

Osa-Omoregie, O and Gbenedio, U, B (2018) The Effect of Cooperative Language Learning in Student's Achievement in Composition Writing in A Selected Secondary School in Nigeria in Research in English and Applied Linguistics: By Schmied, J, Hofmann, M and Esimaje, A. (Cuvillier Verlag).

Osegbue, G. C. (2025). Early childhood education in Nigeria: challenges and prospects. *Unizik Journal of Educational Laws and Leadership Studies*, *2*(1).

Osegbue, G. C. (2025). Crisis intervention and response in educational institutions: developing and implementing plans in developing countries. *African Journal of Educational Management, Teaching and Entrepreneurship Studies*, *15*(1).

Osikomaiya, M (2005) Effective Teaching of Oral English. In Jitowo. A (Ed) Schools in Language Teaching: A Book of Reading. Ibadan: Bounty Press

Osisanwo, A (2012) Fundamental Of English Phonetics And Phonology (2" Edition). Lagos Femolus-Fetop Pub Richard, J, C (2014) Principles of The Eclectic Approach Retrieved Professorjackrichards.Com

Shah, M (2008) Education, Entrepreneurship, Management, Market, Operation Management, Strategic Management. In Cseducation.blogspot.com

Williams, D (1999). English Language Teaching and Integrated Approach. Ibadan: Spectrum Books Limited.